

---

## MINUTES

### Forest Genetics Council – Meeting March 11, 2009

#### Meeting held at the Richmond Inn Best Western, Richmond, BC

Attending: Annette Van Niejenhuis, Brian Barber, Frank Gundersen, Alvin Yanchuk, Al McDonald, Larry Promnitz, Mike Carlson, Chris Hawkins, Bruce MacNicol, Scott King, Joe Leblanc,

*Regrets:* Gary Hogan, Madeline Maley

*Others:* Keith Thomas and Jack Woods

*Guests:* Sally Ailken (UBC), Rob Guy (UBC),

#### Action Items

Responsibility	Action
Program Manager	<p><b>Jack / Brian:</b> Contact Brian McNaughton of the Federation of BC Woodlots to discuss representation. To be discussed with Jim Snetsinger. (to be done with Brian).</p> <p><b>Jack / Brian:</b> Discuss membership options with the Canadian Forest Service PFC Director General and Manager of Forest Biology</p> <p>Include in a future meeting agenda discussion on how to set priorities within and across various program areas.</p>
Council members	<p><b>Brian</b> to ask Jim Snetsinger to recruit an industry co-chair, as industry has been unable to get support internally</p> <p><b>Brian\Keith</b> to pursue FGC membership with Rick Brand\Dave Bodak</p> <p><b>Brian</b> to inform Jim Snetsinger of the FGC recommendation to appoint Tim Lee as ITAC chair and as a member of Council</p> <p><b>Brian</b> to write a letter to Don Piggott conveying reasons for Council recommendations and decision regarding BCTSDA membership on Council.</p> <p><b>TAC Chairs</b> to seek additional membership for their respective TACs from the BCTSD Association and from the Forest Nursery Association or people involved with commercial nurseries.</p> <p><b>Council</b> to revisit the Genetic Resource Decision Support subprogram to evaluate the focus and direction to ensure efficient utilization of resources.</p> <p><b>Brian</b> to forward the letter from Shawn Mansfield (UBC) requesting support for the 2009 IUFRO Biotechnology meeting.</p>
Program Financial Coordinator	<p><b>Keith / Jack</b> will:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. inform FGC members when a final FIA funding allocation is known.</li><li>2. prepare subprogram allocation options, using FGC discussion for guidance</li><li>3. organize a FGC conference call to finalize budget recommendations across all subprograms.</li></ol>

#### Summary of Motions:

1. **MOVED** (Promnitz / MacNicol): Meeting agenda accepted with amendments. CARRIED.
2. **MOVED** (Van Niejenhuis/ Gundersen): Minutes of the meeting held December 17, 2008 are hereby approved. CARRIED.

3. **MOVED** (Van Niejenhuis/ Hawkins): Council accepts the ITAC recommendation that Tim Lee be considered for the position of ITAC chair, and will make a recommendation to Jim Snetsinger for an appointment to Council as the ITAC Chair representative. CARRIED.
4. **MOVED** (Carlson/Hawkins): Council recommends to ITAC and CTAC that the BC Tree Seed Dealers association be invited to participate as voting members on their respective TACs and that the TAC Chairs seek this membership. CARRIED.
5. **MOVED** (Carleson/Gundersen): Council approves the SelectSeed 2009/10 Business Plan as presented with contingencies. CARRIED.

**Meeting called to order at 9:15 A.M. by Brian Barber (MFR Co-Chair)**

1. **Agenda:** Brian recommended some re-ordering of the agenda..
  1. **MOVED** (Promnitz / MacNicol): Meeting agenda accepted with amendments. CARRIED.
2. **Approval of December 17, 2008 minutes:**
  2. **MOVED** (Van Niejenhuis/ Gundersen): Minutes of the meeting held December 17, 2008 are hereby approved. CARRIED.

**3. Old Business and Action Items from December 17, 2008**

**Summary of action items and progress from the December 17, 2008 FGC meeting**

<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Action requested</b>	<b>Action taken</b>
Jack	Send a list of membership status to FGC members for review, as well as background on the expectations for the FGC Co-Chair.	Membership list shown under agenda item 4 below
Industry members	An Industry Co-Chair will be recommended by current industry members on Council in advance of the March 2009 meeting	Discussed under agenda item 4
Brian and Jack	Follow-up with the CFS with respect to renewing membership on Council	Discussed under agenda item 4
Brian and Jack	Review all membership and member terms and bring for discussion at the March FGC meeting	Discussed under agenda item 4
Brian and Jack	Review membership with Jim Snetsinger	Discussed under agenda item 4
Jack	Invite Don Pigott to make a presentation to Council regarding why the BC Tree Seed Dealers Assoc. should have membership on Council	Done – declined; letter sent. Discuss under item 4 below
Jack	Review FGC bylaws to determine how changes in membership structure are dealt with	Discussed under agenda item 4
Council members	Forward comments on industry's role in seed orchards, and on options, to Jack prior to the January 16, 2009 meeting in Prince George.	Done - discuss under agenda item 7
Jack	Combine key parts of the Discussion Paper, comments received, and options for distribution in advance of the January 16, 2009 meeting in Prince George	Done - discuss under agenda item 7
Jack	Keep FGC members informed on developments regarding the industry participation in seed orchards discussion	Done - discuss under agenda item 7
Council members	Provide written comments on the 2009-2014 Strategic Plan to Jack by January 5 <sup>th</sup> , 2009	Done – see agenda item 8
Jack	Jack to post members names on the FGC website by the end of December	Done
Joe and Bruce	Joe and Bruce will discuss the FGC Industry Co-Chair issue with Archie McDonald (COFI) and Les Kiss (CFPA) to keep them informed.	Done

#### 4. FGC Membership – Jack Woods

##### Structure, current membership and position status

Stakeholder representative	Incumbent	Decision made or action to be taken
<b>Co-chairs</b> - industry	Vacant	<b>Brian</b> to ask Jim Snetsinger to recruit an industry co-chair, as industry has been unable to get support internally
- MFR	Brian Barber	
<b>Ministry of Forests and Range</b>	Madeline Maley (S. Int. Region)	Taking over from Mike Madill
	Alvin Yanchuk	Gerry Still (Research Branch Director) to take over
	Al McDonald	
<b>Industry</b> - interior seed producer	Bruce MacNicol	
- interior seed user (north)	Frank Gundersen	Final meeting for Frank. Brian and Jack will contact Brian McNaughton of the Federation of BC Woodlots to discuss representation. To be discussed with Jim Snetsinger.
- interior seed user (south)	Scott King	
- Coast seed user	Joe Leblanc	
- Coast seed producer	Larry Promnitz	
<b>Coastal TAC Chair</b>	Annette van Niejenhuis	
<b>Interior TAC Chair</b>	Mike Carlson	ITAC recommended Tim Lee as chair and Council rep; approved by FGC; recommendation to be made to Jim Snetsinger
<b>University</b>	Chris Hawkins	Rob Guy (UBC) will take over as University rep
<b>Canadian Forest Service</b>	Gary Hogan	Gary has retired. Jack and Brian are discussing options with CFS
<b>FIA (non-voting)</b>	Vacant	Brian and Keith to pursue with Rick Brand/Dave Bodak
<b>Voting members</b>	<b>14</b>	

#### Membership motions and discussion:

- MOVED** (Van Niejenhuis/ Hawkins): Council accepts the ITAC recommendation that Tim Lee be considered for the position of ITAC chair, and will make a recommendation to Jim Snetsinger for an appointment to Council as the ITAC Chair representative. CARRIED.

#### BC Tree Seed Dealers Association

- MOVED** (Carlson/Hawkins): Council recommends to ITAC and CTAC that the BC Tree Seed Dealers Association be invited to participate as voting members on their respective TACs and that the TAC Chairs seek this membership. CARRIED.

**Action:** Brian: will write a letter to Don Piggott conveying reasons for recommendations and decision

Discussion ensued regarding participation by the Forest Nursery Association of BC, which also has an interest in tree improvement, tree seed, and forest genetics.

**Action:** TACs Chairs to seek additional membership for their respective TACs from the BCTSD Association and from the Forest Nursery Association or people involved with commercial nurseries.

## 5. Budgets and business planning for 2009/10

Jack presented the following five steps in the budget process:

1. Subprogram and project committees develop business plans and budget recommendations for Council.
2. Council reviews all subprogram and project budget recommendations.
3. Council resolves shortfalls, balances among subprograms and projects, and recommends a final budget by formal resolution.
4. The FGC Program Manager forwards Council's budget recommendation to the Forest Investment Council and the Provincial Chief Forester.
5. Final budget approval is given by the Deputy Minister.

As the final allocation of FIA funds is currently not known, this budget cannot be finalized.

### General discussion points:

- Budget items should be prioritized and reduced according to priority, rather than across the board general reductions
- Some lower value SPU's should be considered for cost reductions
- **Action** – a future meeting agenda should include time for discussion on how to set priorities within and across various program areas.

### Discussion by subprogram:

#### Genetic Conservation

- Sally Aitken provided a good overview of this subprogram and the projects underway
- GCTAC budget recommendation accepted, but subject to adjustment to the overall budget

#### Tree Breeding

- About half of the overall breeding budget goes to salary and cannot be reduced
- Measurement of progeny tests is the area that can most easily be deferred for budget reductions. In 2009/10, about \$360,000 is budgeted for progeny tests; this could be reduced to \$180,000 if necessary.

#### OTIP

- Review committee approval of \$760,000 worth of proposals (\$580 coast and \$180 interior)
- Under new government rules there is no longer an option of risk managing funds
- Reductions could be found by dropping lowest-ranked projects or by reducing the Management category (WBS 327), or some combination

#### SelectSeed

- The SelectSeed Business Plan was presented. This Plan was previously approved by the SelectSeed Board of Directors
  - Additional funds of \$21,000 (contingencies) were considered to provide some flexibility to Council should projects and needs arise during the year.
5. **MOVED** (Carleson/Gundersen): Council approves the SelectSeed 2009/10 Business Plan as presented with contingencies. CARRIED.

#### Extension

- Budget supported as presented, subject to final adjustment across subprograms

#### Cone and Seed Pest Management

- Budget supported as presented, subject to final adjustment across subprograms

Genecology and Seed Transfer

- This process is still underway. It is understood that a final budget recommendation will come to Council when the overall budget is known

Genetic Resource Decision Support

- Budget supported as presented, subject to final adjustment across subprograms
- **Action:** Council to revisit this subprogram within the next few months to evaluate the focus and direction to ensure efficient utilization of resources.

Cone Induction Project (UVic – von Aderkas)

- The full budget option was supported, subject to final adjustment across subprograms

Applied Tree Improvement and Biotechnology (UBC – El-Kassaby)

- Budget option 3 was supported, subject to final adjustment across subprograms. At this time, Council does not want significant new commitments started (Redcedar selfing/SMP effectiveness project).

NSERC Industrial Research Chair Support

- This item is supported in general. Allocations methods (MFR grant vs. SelectSeed grant) will be subject to discussion in each fiscal years budget approval process.

**Actions** to finalize budget:

1. Keith Thomas and Jack Woods will inform FGC members when a final FIA allocation is known.
2. Using FGC allocations and discussion for guidance, Jack and Keith will prepare subprogram allocation options.
3. A conference call will be convened to finalize budget recommendations across all subprograms.

<b>Subprogram</b>	<b>Option 1 Requested</b>	<b>Option 2</b>	<b>Option 3</b>	<b>Recommended</b>	<b>Further reduced</b>
Genetic Conservation	\$471,500	\$434,000	\$430,000	\$430,000	\$430,000
Tree Breeding*	\$2,400,000	\$2,230,000	\$2,150,000	\$2,150,000	\$2,100,000
Operational Tree Imp. Prog. (OTIP)	\$740,000	\$760,000	\$720,000	\$740,000	\$740,000
SelectSeed Ltd.	\$689,000	\$710,000	\$710,000 b	\$710,000	\$710,000
Extension and Communication	\$120,000	\$110,250	\$110,250	\$112,250	\$112,000
Cone and Seed Pest Management	\$409,600	\$394,600	\$380,600	\$380,600	\$380,000
Genecology and Seed Transfer	\$475,000	\$425,000	\$375,000	\$362,000	\$335,000
Genetic Resource Decision Support	\$100,000	\$75,000	\$60,000	\$40,000	\$40,000
Administration*	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$44,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$5,455,100</b>	<b>\$5,188,850</b>	<b>\$4,985,850</b>	<b>\$4,974,850</b>	<b>\$4,891,000</b>
<b>Incremental projects</b>					
Cone induction/crop enhancement (von Aderkas - UVic)	\$163,000	\$163,000	\$139,000	\$139,000	\$139,000
Applied Tree Impr. and biotechnology (YE-K UBC)	\$242,080	\$201,640	\$169,240	\$165,240	\$165,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$405,080</b>	<b>\$364,640</b>	<b>\$308,240</b>	<b>\$304,240</b>	<b>\$304,000</b>
<b>TOTAL - BASE AND INCREMENTAL</b>	<b>\$5,860,180</b>	<b>\$5,553,490</b>	<b>\$5,294,090</b>	<b>\$5,279,090</b>	<b>\$5,195,000</b>

## 6. Industry Participation in Seed Orchards

The issue of industries role in seed orchards and the financial issues associated with continued participation by some companies was further discussed. The following has taken place to date.

1. August, 2008 – WFP approached the MFR and FGC Program Manager to discuss issues associated with continued operation of their Saanich orchard. Issues were also raised by other private sector orchard owners.
2. September 2008 – Discussion Paper prepared and reviewed by the FGC
3. Fall, 2008 – Further input from industry and MFR stakeholders summarized in a 2<sup>nd</sup> draft Discussion Paper
4. December, 2008 – FGC review of the 2<sup>nd</sup> draft Discussion Paper. Process set out for further stakeholder input and for provincial Chief Forester review.
5. January 2009 – meeting between Prov. Chief Forester (Jim Snetsinger) and industry representatives (held in PG). Well attended by major forest companies (Canfor, Interfor, West Fraser, Tolko, Lakeland Mills, TimberWest, Western Forest Prod.). PRT also sent two reps, and several MFR people attended.
6. **Outcome:** one-on-one discussions by Brian Barber and Jack Woods with industry representatives (orchard owners and seed buyers), plus other key stakeholders.
7. Planned report with options to be made to Jim Snetsinger following the March 11<sup>th</sup> FGC discussion.

Annette pointed out that the continued private sector participation in the seed orchard business strengthens tree improvement and the seed delivery system. Also, the broader, cooperative approach allows more management flexibility to deal with changes.

## 7. FGC Strategic Plan 2009-2014

The FGC Strategic Plan for 2009 to 2014 has been drafted, reviewed by Council (December, 2008), and presented to the Provincial Chief Forester (February 2009). Jim Snetsinger has not yet had time to fully review and approve the plan.

A draft of the full plan was distributed for further comment. Upon receipt of Jim Snetsinger's approval the plan will be printed and posted on the FGC website.

## 8. MFR seed-use audit

Brian discussed an audit of compliance with the Chief Forester Standards for Seed Use. Results showed that 0.6% (26 of 1991) of sowing requests used non-legitimate overrides on SPAR and used class B when class A was available.

## 9. Asset and benefit sharing

Brian provided an overview of international work on the access to and sharing of benefits from biological materials. This is primarily directed at "mining" biological materials for pharmacological use, but could also apply to forestry. The MFR is participating in Canadian ABS discussions. There are no "red flags" for Council at this point.

**10. New Business**

A. Letter from Shawn Mansfield regarding support for a IUFRO Biotech Conference to be held in Vancouver.

**Action:** Letter from Shawn to be forwarded to FGC (Brian)

**Action:** Include this item in the final budget conference call in April (Jack)

Meeting was adjourned at 3:15 PM.

**Next meeting: June 17<sup>th</sup>, 2009 (to be held by conference call)**

Minutes prepared by;

*Keith Thomas* and

