

MINUTES

Forest Genetics Council – Meeting March 10, 2016

Meeting held at the TimberWest Forests Corp. Nanaimo office.

Attendees: Brian Barber (Co-Chair; acted as meeting chair), Mark Tamas (Co-Chair), Shane Ford, Rob Guy, Domenico Iannidinardo, Stephen Joyce, Joe LeBlanc, Chris Stagg (by phone), Annette van Niejenhuis, Raoul Wiart, Gernot Zemanek

Regrets: Mark Hay, Scott King, Gerry MacDougall, ,

Others: Henry Benskin, Glen Dunsworth (by phone) and Kerry McGourlick (SelectSeed Ltd. Board); Babita Bains, Alana Phillips, Al Powelson , Margo Spence, Michael Stoehr, Jack Woods

Action Items

Responsibility	Action
All FGC members	Review bylaws pertaining to member-meeting attendance and the assignment of delegates to meetings for discussion at the June FGC meeting.
Jack	Complete an analysis of seed supply and demand for all interior seed planning units using harvest flow information.
Stephen (and Jack)	Set up and lead three workshops in key interior areas to inform local foresters about genetic resource management and to seek input on seed demand (before September 2016).
Stephen and Jack	Prepare a clear motion on interior seed orchard expansions for FGC decision at the September, 2016 FGC meeting.
Jack	Post the document "Guiding Principles Respecting Public and Private Seed Orchard Management in BC" on the FGC website.
Brian, Darrell Wood	Review the purpose of OTIP and eligibility criteria as part of the LEAN review process.
Jack, Brian, Mark T.	Prepare a letter with a budget recommendation for the Provincial Chief Forester by March 20, 2016.
Jack	Communicate with TAC chairs on the approved budget levels.
Brian, Mark T., Jack, others who can participate	Present the budget recommendation to the Provincial Chief Forester and identify shortfalls.
Brian, Shane	Prepare a recommendation for an additional \$300,000 of "unfunded pressures" to be added to the 2016/17 LBIS Tree Improvement Program budget for internal MFLNRO review.
Jack	Determine how much was given to the BC SOA last time they held a meeting, and send an email vote to FGC members to canvas them regarding support for their 2016 meeting.
Jack	Poll FGC members to find a meeting dates in mid June and September, 2016.

Summary of Motions:

1. MOVED (LeBlanc / van Niejenhuis) that the agenda for this meeting is approved as presented. CARRIED.
2. MOVED (Iannidinardo / Guy) that minutes from the December 10, 2015 meeting are hereby approved as presented. CARRIED.
3. MOVED (van Niejenhuis/Iannidinardo) that the SelectSeed Business Plan for 2016/17 is approved as presented. CARRIED.

4. MOVED (Zemanek / van Niejenhuis) that an overall budget of \$2.5 million, with allocations as shown above, will be recommended to the Provincial Chief Forester, and that an underfunded amount of \$300,000 is identified and a recommendation will be made to provide these additional funds for breeding and genecology needs.
5. MOVED that the BC Forest Genetics Society members direct the SelectSeed Board to proceed with the dual-service delivery model set out in their letter to the FGC dated February 10, 2016. CARRIED (12 votes in favour, including 2 proxy votes); 0 votes against; 1 abstention (Barber)).

Meeting called to order at 9:00 A.M. by Brian Barber (meeting chair)

- Domenico welcomed Council members and guests to Nanaimo and TimberWest's office facility. Safety procedures were reviewed.
- Noted by Jack Woods that proxy votes are held as follows: Stephen Joyce for Mark Hay, Brian Barber for Gerry MacDougall, and Mark Tamas for Scott King.

1. Agenda:

MOVED (van Niejenhuis / Iannidinardo) that the agenda is approved as presented. CARRIED.

2. Old business and action items from December 10, 2015

The following action items were reviewed.

Responsibility	Action	Action taken
Jack	Include an update on stocking standards in the March, 2016 FGC meeting agenda.	Deferred
Annette, Stephen	Include an update on stocking standards in CTAC and ITAC meetings on seed supply and demand.	Done
Annette, Stephen	CTAC and ITAC will look for opportunities to engage with ENGO reps	Discussed at meetings.
Scott, Joe, Gernot, Brian, Jack	Work with the appropriate private-sector groups, COFI, CLMA and ILMA to get nominations for replacements or renewals for FGC members whose membership terms have lapsed.	Done
Brian, Jack	Reach out to Universities with forestry programs to seek renewal or new nominations for an academic rep on Council (UBC, UVic, UNBC).	Done
Jack	Put FGC membership as a standing item for all June FGC meetings.	Done
Stephen	ITAC is asked to review the report "Class A seed Supply and Demand Profiles for Interior Lodgepole Pine, Spruce, and Douglas-fir Seed Planning Units - Dec. 2015" and provide recommendations to the FGC.	Done; to be discussed
Brian, Mark T.	On behalf of Council, draft a response to the October 15, 2015 letter received from the Vernon Seed Orchard Company.	Done
Brian	Communicate FGC wishes regarding SCL CEO / FGC Program Manager recruitment with the SCL Board of Directors and continue to interface with the Board on this issue.	Done; to be discussed
Industry members of Council	Speak to MFLNR executive about the need for succession planning in tree breeding programs.	Ongoing
Brian	Communicate with TAC chairs about the new Call process that will be used for non-Ministry projects not included in OTIP or the UBC Center for Forest Conservation Genetics funding.	Done
Jack, Annette, Stephen, Michael	Organize overall 2016/17 LBIS Tree Improvement Program budget numbers in a matrix that shows projects and strategic objectives.	Done
Brian	Council requests that TACs consider the new pest resistance Strategic Objective and bring forward actions in support of this objective. Brian will	Done

	prepare a memo to TAC chairs with this request.	
Darrell Wood	Prepare a listing, in spreadsheet format, of issues raised by FGC members during the LEAN review discussion for distribution to Council prior to the March, 2016.	Ongoing
Jack	Poll FGC members to find a meeting date in the first two weeks of March on a Tuesday, Wednesday, or Thursday.	Done

3. December 10, 2015 minutes:

MOVED (Iannidinardo / Guy) that minutes from the December 10, 2015 meeting are hereby approved.
CARRIED.

4. FGC membership

Brian reviewed the following Council membership changes:

- Shane Ford replaces Dr. Michael Stoehr as Ministry Rep.
- Three year renewal of memberships for Domenico Iannidinardo, Scott King, Joe LeBlanc, and Gernot Zemanek were made following discussion with the appropriate industry associations.
- Three year renewal for Dr. Rob Guy following discussions with various university people.
- Three year renewal for Raoul Wiart following discussion with Judy Beck and others at the Pacific Forestry Center.

Following discussion on Council-member absenteeism it was agreed that Council would review bylaws pertaining to attendance and sending delegates to meetings.

Action: Review bylaws pertaining to member-meeting attendance and the assignment of delegates to meetings for discussion at the June FGC meeting (FGC members).

5. Standing items:

Climate-based seed transfer

Margot reviewed the structuring of a Seed Policy Working Group within the Ministry. She is planning a workshop on the science of CBST with Greg O'Neill in May and hopes to involve stakeholders and FGC members. Policy development is on track for 2020 goals, but behind on 2018 due to lack of tools esp. mapping/GIS. Budgets are not sufficient to create capacity to produce tools needed. A Science Report will be coming out soon.

Mark T. and others expressed concern about licensee ability to develop climate change strategies for Forest Stewardship Plans in the absence of policies. A cohesive strategy is needed. Operators need to feel supported in decision-making and a shared-risk approach is needed. If operators make planting decisions based on predictions, and these are incorrect, what then?

Raoul pointed out that it is important to collaborate with Canadian Forest Service people to avoid duplication of effort and to cultivate relationships. This can also lead to funding in some instances.

Margot asked members to inform her if they are interested in attending a 1-day workshop on the science of CBST in May.

Succession

Brian announced that four technical staff in Tree Improvement Branch (TIB) will be retiring early this year. All four positions will be filled through competitions that are underway. Shane reviewed responses to applications. In addition, another TIB technician is expected to retire later this year and one breeder may retire next year.

6. Interior seed supply and demand – Stephen

Data on orchard supply was reviewed by a group of orchard managers in January. Information from this review was incorporated by Jack into the analysis behind the report "Class A seed Supply and Demand Profiles for Interior Lodgepole Pine, Spruce, and Douglas-fir Seed Planning Units". The report was presented to ITAC and discussed. Concern was expressed by ITAC members about the veracity of some of the data. This is acknowledged in the report. ITAC passed the following motion:

" To support orchard expansion for the three northern SPUs for Lodgepole pine with best available material, to seek more information on projected demand, and delay retirement of first generation orchards."

Stephen and Jack presented some analysis using harvest flow data from the MFLNRO analyzed for Pli seed planning units (SPU). These data suggest a similar outcome to the earlier analysis; additional Pli orchard capacity is needed for the PG, BV, CP and EK seed planning units.

Stephen recommended field review by holding several regional workshops. These can have the dual purpose of extension and seeking input on longer term seed demand in some key interior SPUs. Raoul requested that a clear motion on the matter of orchard expansions be brought to FGC at the September 2016 meeting.

Council members agreed that it is their role to make recommendations regarding orchard needs and that the Chief Forester's 2010 "Guiding Principles Respecting Public and Private Seed Orchard Management in BC" should continue to apply. Jack was asked to post this document on the FGC website.

Action: Jack will complete an analysis of seed supply and demand for all interior seed planning units using harvest flow information.

Action: Stephen will set up and lead three workshops in key interior areas to inform local foresters about genetic resource management and to seek input on seed demand (before September 2016).

Action: Prepare a clear motion on interior seed orchard expansions for FGC decision at the September, 2016 FGC meeting.

Action: Post the document "Guiding Principles Respecting Public and Private Seed Orchard Management in BC" on the FGC website.

7. LBIS 2015/16 expenditures - Brian

Brian presented the following summary of LBIS spending during the current fiscal year. It is expected that final spending will be very close to the full \$2.5 million allocation.

Subprogram	Budget	Expected year-end expenditure	Difference
Genetic Conservation	\$ 238,970.00	\$ 238,970.00	\$ -
Tree Breeding	\$ 1,130,734.00	\$ 1,188,067.00	\$ 57,333.00
OTIP	\$ 502,622.00	\$ 446,505.00	-\$ 56,117.00
Pest Management	\$ 71,072.00	\$ 71,072.00	\$ -
Genecology and Seed Transfer	\$ 361,052.00	\$ 361,052.00	\$ -
Decision Support	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 44,000.00	-\$ 16,000.00
Applied Tree Improvement and Biotech	\$ 125,550.00	\$ 125,500.00	-\$ 50.00
Administration	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 11,071.00	\$ 1,071.00
Total	\$ 2,500,000.00	\$ 2,486,237.00	-\$ 13,763.00

8. SelectSeed business plan for 2016/17 - Jack

Jack presented the SelectSeed Business Plan for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2017. This plan proposed spending of \$874,000, including \$143,000 on FGC business and a \$100,000 payment to the MFLNRO and interior tree breeder salary in TIB. Seed sale revenue is forecast at \$903,000. This Plan was approved by the SelectSeed Board of Directors on February 29, 2016.

Council members queried SelectSeed Board members in attendance about their perspective on the Plan and on seed pricing. It was pointed out that one of the original objectives for setting up SelectSeed was to provide transparent information on seed pricing to buyers, as the seed market does not have competitive pricing and buyers need some assurance that seed prices reasonably reflect production costs. This objective is met and seed price is set accordingly by SelectSeed management.

MOVED (van Niejenhuis/Iannidinaro) that the SelectSeed Business Plan for 2016/17 is approved as presented. CARRIED.

9. 2016/17 LBIS Tree Improvement Program budgets by subprogram

Jack provided an overview of the budget development process.

Tree Breeding

Annette provided an overview of CTAC discussion and recommendations on coastal breeding budgets. An incremental amount to support a redcedar genomics project was noted.

Stephen provided a similar overview of ITAC discussion and recommendations on interior breeding budgets.

Budgets contain funds for some auxiliary staff at research stations. It was agreed that any reductions to the breeding budgets will be at the total-budget level and specific project reductions it is best left to the TIB Forest Genetics Section Manager to determine priorities.

OTIP

Stephen and Annette described OTIP development and review procedures followed for interior and coastal proposals.

Discussion ensued on the purpose of OTIP and eligibility criteria. It was agreed that these criteria should be reviewed.

Action: Review the purpose of OTIP and eligibility criteria as part of the LEAN review process (Brian, Darrell Wood).

Seed and Cone Pest Management

On behalf of PMTAC chairs Ward Strong and Tia Wagner, Jack presented the PMTAC budget development process and recommendations.

To accommodate Glen Dunsworth calling in to the meeting Council carried on with item #10, SelectSeed Succession, before continuing with the following subprogram budget discussions.

Seed Transfer and Genecology; Decision Support

Margot Spence presented the process followed, and budgets developed, by the STTAC and Decision Support TAC. The DSTAC budget was presented on behalf of Jason Regnier, DSTAC chair.

Genetic Conservation TAC

On behalf of chair, Pia Smets, Jack presented the process followed and budget developed by the GCTAC.

Applied Tree Improvement and Biotechnology

A single proposal was received and reviewed by an expert committee. Jack briefly reviewed this process and the project.

Overall budget discussion

Following discussion on specific subprograms and projects, the following budget allocations were agreed to:

<u>Subprogram</u>	<u>FGC recommendation</u>	<u>Request to cover shortfall</u>	<u>W/ risk mgt</u>
Genetic Conservation	\$ 188,700		\$ 188,700
Tree Breeding	\$ 1,180,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 1,380,000
Operational Tree Imp. Prog.	\$ 424,000		\$ 424,000
Extension and Communication	\$ -		\$ -
Cone and Seed Pest Mgt.	\$ 137,000		\$ 137,000
Seed Transfer and Genecology	\$ 428,800	\$ 100,000	\$ 528,800
Decision Support	\$ 76,500		\$ 76,500
Tree Imp. Branch administration	\$ 10,000		\$ 10,000
Applied Tree Impr. and Biotech.	\$ 55,000		\$ 55,000
Miscellaneous (conferences)			
Subtotal	\$ 2,500,000	\$ 300,000	\$ 2,800,000

A shortfall amount of \$300,000 was identified and a request will be made to provide this additional amount.

MOVED (Zemanek / van Niejenhuis) that an overall budget of \$2.5 million, with allocations as shown above, will be recommended to the Provincial Chief Forester, and that an underfunded amount of \$300,000 is identified and a recommendation will be made to provide these additional funds for breeding and genecology needs. **CARRIED.**

Action: Prepare a letter with a budget recommendation for the Provincial Chief Forester by March 20, 2016 (Jack, Brian, Mark T.)

Action: Jack will communicate with TAC chairs on the approved budget levels.

Action: Present the budget recommendation to the Provincial Chief Forester and identify shortfalls (Brian, Mark T., Jack, other FGC members who can attend)

Action: Prepare a recommendation for an additional \$300,000 of "unfunded pressures" to be added to the 2016/17 LBIS Tree Improvement Program budget for internal MFLNRO review (Brian, Shane)

10. Succession of the SelectSeed Company Ltd. CEO and the FGC Program Manager

SelectSeed Ltd. board members Glen Dunsworth (Board Chair), Henry Benskin, and Kerry McGourlick attended the meeting to present and discuss this item.

Henry Benskin presented a business case for a dual service delivery model that would continue with SelectSeed providing management services and support to the FGC.

Brian presented a briefing note outlining alternative models for providing FGC management services, including: 1. TIB assuming responsibility for these services, and 2. SelectSeed or the BC Forest

Genetics Society (using funds from SelectSeed) hires a person to provide these services in an "executive secretariat" role.

Following discussion, preference was expressed for the status quo dual service model.

MOVED that the BC Forest Genetics Society members direct the SelectSeed Board to proceed with the dual-service delivery model set out in their letter to the FGC dated February 10, 2016. CARRIED (12 votes in favour, including 2 proxy votes); 0 votes against; 1 abstention (Barber)).

It was recognized that it is the responsibility of the SelectSeed Board to proceed with needed staff changes. Glen and Henry acknowledged that they believe this to be a Board responsibility and they will discuss with the rest of the Board what role Brian should play in the recruitment process.

11. LEAN review update

Brian announced that more will be done on this review at subsequent FGC meetings. Preliminary notes were received from Darrell Wood. It was agreed that a full discussion on this matter would be held at the September, 2016 meeting in advance of the new business planning cycle.

12. New business and announcements

The following were announced:

- Brian: seven large scale applied research program proposals related to forestry in BC are being submitted to Genome Canada.
- Brian: the provincial government has formed a society for investment in forestry activities. More is expected to be heard on this in the coming months.
- Annette: CTAC held a discussion on the real cost of relying on hemlock natural regeneration. Many feel that there is a short term gain but a longer term opportunity cost. Annette suggested that funds and effort should be applied to better understand the costs and benefits of planting relative to natural regeneration.

14. Requests for conference support

Brian and Jack announced that requests for conference support were received from the following groups:

- BC Seed Orchard Association (from Bevin Wigmore)
- Canadian Botanical Association (from Patrick von Aderkas)
- a Biotech meeting to be held in the lower mainland (from Yousry El-Kassaby)

Action: Jack will determine how much was given to the BCSOA last time they held a meeting and send an email vote to FGC members to canvas them regarding support for their 2016 meeting.

15. Next meetings

Action: Jack will poll FGC members to find a meeting dates in mid June and September, 2016.

Locations:

June, 2016 - Conference call (this will be the combined FGC meeting, BC Forest Genetics Society meeting, and SelectSeed Ltd. AGM)

September, 2016 - To be hosted by Interfor in the Campbell River area. Planned field viewing of a 20-year-old Douglas-fir genetic realized gain trial and redcedar trials.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.



Minutes prepared by Jack Woods with support from Alana Phillips