

Draft Minutes – FGC Business Meeting

8:30 am – 3:30 pm, Friday, December 8, 2017

Location: Executive Airport Plaza Hotel, Richmond BC.

Members present:

Mark Tamas, Patrick Martin, Annette van Niejenhuis, Dan Peterson, Domenico Iannidinardo (via phone), Kori Vernier, Gernot Zemanek, Joe LeBlanc, Jeff Mycock, Mark Hay, Rob Guy, Scott King, Tony Hopkin.

Regrets (and proxy):

Jennifer Davis (n/a) and Shane Ford (Pat)

Others present:

Shane Berg, Deputy Chief Forester, Brian Barber, FGC Program Mgr/SelectSeed, Stephen Joyce, Manager Seed Production, FLNR, Michael Stoehr, Manager, Forest Genetics, FLNR, Margot Spence, Seed Policy Officer, FLNR, and Dan Gaudet, Manager, Vernon Seed Orchard Co.

Summary of Motions

- The minutes of the FGC meeting held October 18, 2017, with minor corrections noted, are hereby approved (Annette/Joe) CARRIED.
- FGC supports the VSOC request to develop a 2nd generation Pli orchard to serve its partners’ seed needs; FGC supports the FIRM request to establish replacement Pli orchards with 2nd generation material consistent with ITAC’s Strategy for Northern Pli Class A. (Annette/Pat) CARRIED.
- FGC direct SelectSeed to renew its MOU with FIRM for another 3-year term to fund one FTE (salary and benefits) in the tree breeding program to a maximum of \$100k annually. (Annette/Kori). CARRIED
- The FGC Recommendations on Seed Supply and Use in Wildfire-impacted Areas, updated on December 2, 2017, are hereby approved. (Joe/Gernot) CARRIED.

Summary of Action Items:

Who	Actions
FGC	Review new model and update FGC Bylaws following 2018/19 budget submission – as deemed necessary - in Spring 2018. (Carry forward from approved Streamlining actions)
FGC	Initiate processes to develop an FGC Communication and Extension plan in 2018/19. (Carry forward from approved Streamlining actions)
Brian	Request CoAdapTree team share the results of its GE³LS (Genomics Ethical, Environmental, Economic, Legal and Social) research with FGC.
Margot	CBST experts to present scientific-foundation of CBST to FGC and forest professionals at various forums and meetings.
Co-chairs	Reply to the VSOC and FIRM letters re 2 nd generation Pli orchard interests.
Co-chairs	Reply to the October 8 th letter from SelectSeed.

Co-chairs (& Brian)	Provide budget targets and direction to TAC chairs in preparing budget proposals for 2018/19.
Brian	Forward FGC's seed use recommendations to Diane Nicholls.
Brian	Issue Doodle Polls for face-to-face budget meeting in Victoria in early March, and fall field trip in Golden for September.

Proceedings:

The meeting was held at the Executive Airport Plaza and chaired by Mark Tamas. An agenda and several attachments were forwarded to members in advance via email. Brian Barber was appointed to record the minutes of the meeting.

1. Welcome and Introductions

Mark called the meeting to order, confirmed attendance, and welcomed guests. Housekeeping and safety announcements were made.

2. Agenda

The draft agenda, including attachments and presentations were reviewed. Mark indicated that some items may need to be discussed in-camera and guests would subsequently be excused. Brian also explained the difference between regular motions vs resolutions for recording minutes.

Motion: The Agenda presented for this meeting is hereby approved (Joe/Scott) CARRIED.

3. Action Items and Minutes from October 18, 2017

The action items and draft minutes of FGC's meeting held on October 18, 2017 in Prince George were reviewed. A few additional updates and some minor corrections to the minutes were noted.

Who	Actions from Oct 18	Status
Pat	Confirm data source (e.g. RESULTS vs SPAR) and "automated process" Forest Analysis and Inventory Branch will use to incorporate genetic gain in TSR.	Completed
Members	Send Skype contact request to "Brian T Barber" . Skype or Skype for Business to be used for future FGC conference calls	In progress – Not urgent with face to face meetings
Tony, Pat, Annette and Shane Ford	Discuss Forest Health positions to assist tree breeders and resourcing options (employee, partnership with CFS or university vs consultant)	In progress – Pat discussing options with NRCan and Forest Health
Shane Berg	Share proposed FLNR research positions with FGC and invite comments.	Completed - FGC appreciated knowing scope of positions
Pat	Prepare position description(s) for FGC to consider funding salary through another MoU with SelectSeed.	See item #8

FGC	Subject to outcome of above action item, FGC to prepare a response to SelectSeed’s June 14th letter.	See item #9
FGC or Company Members	Subject to outcome of above items, to consider drafting letter to Ministry requesting additional base-funded tree improvement position(s).	TBD
FIRM	Consider private investments in seed inventories and seed orchards (\$ and seed supply) in CBST transition plan.	See item #4
FGC	Refine FGC’s draft 2017 Wildfire Seed Use Principles and Recommendations at Dec meeting.	See item # 7
Various actions related to Streamlining Motion	<p>Co-chairs to communicate new model and changes to TAC chairs and members. – Brian to prepare note for Pat to send ASAP</p> <p>ITAC/CTAC chairs to work with Ministry and FGC Program Manager to complete and issue OTIP call for proposals.</p> <p>Solicit interest from FGC members to chair GCTAC.</p> <p>Review historical and current allocations to programs and activities, set targets for each program at FGC’s December conference call.</p> <p>Set date for FGC budget planning meeting end of February or early March; align TAC meeting and budget preparation with this date.</p> <p>Review new model and update FGC Bylaws following 2018/19 budget submission – spring 2018. – as deemed necessary</p> <p>Initiate processes to develop an FGC Communication and Extension plan –2018/19</p>	<p>Completed</p> <p>Completed</p> <p>Completed - Shane Ford new chair</p> <p>See item #11</p> <p>See item #11</p> <p>Carry forward</p> <p>Carry forward</p>
Brian	Arrange FGC thank you gifts for Pia Smets, GCTAC chair and Raoul Wiart, former NRCan rep.	Completed - Presented to Pia Nov 8, Raoul Dec 11
Brian	Initiate FGC Achievement Award nomination for Jack Woods, for FGC’s consideration and presentation at March meeting.	In progress
Brian	Prepare an issue statement re need to update CF Principles for Public and Private Seed Orchard in response to CBST	See item #5
Brian	Issue Doodle Poll for full-day face-to-face meeting end Nov/early December in Richmond	Completed

New Action: Brian to request [CoAdapTree](#) team share the results of its [GE³LS](#) (Genomics Ethical, Environmental, Economic, Legal and Social) research with FGC.

Motion: The minutes of the FGC meeting held October 18, 2017, with minor corrections noted, are hereby approved (Annette/Joe) CARRIED.

4. Climate-based seed transfer

Margot Spence provided an update on CBST, which was informed by a stakeholder policy working group meeting held the previous day. A separate progress report was also provided.

Since the Chief Forester's direction re CBST Alternatives process and new CBST Seedlot selection tool were introduced in Sept. 2017, eight (8) CBST alternatives have been approved. Five (5) "Early Implementation of CBST" webinar sessions were held from Sept to Nov with 40 – 50 attendees. A webinar recording is available on the [CBST website](#).

SPAR revisions (including GIS capacity) expected to be available in the new year. CBST tracking in RESULTS possibly ready in fall 2018.

Margot's team are drafting the amendments to CF Standards for Seed Use with proposed effective date of August 1, 2018. They are also developing policy transition options and implementation plan. Work will be informed by CoAdapTree GE³Ls research. Outreach includes CTAC extension meeting (Dec 6), SISCO winter meeting (Feb 12-14), ABCFP meeting (Feb 21-23), and BC Seed Orchard Assoc. meeting (June 19-20).

The CBST stakeholder working group recommended a short (2-3) year transition period to encourage early adoption and to realize FGC's goal (100% of sowing requested informed by CBST by 2020). Seed supply gaps and potential stranded assets (e.g. A seed displacing B seed investments) can be resolved along the way; don't hold up implementation in the interim.

It was noted some field foresters are concerned about potential risks and liability associated with using the new climate-based standards (if plantations should fail). The short answer was current standards are riskier, and more extension is required to address concerns and questions. It was also requested the applicability and effectiveness of the 5% rule (# of trees per year and license that may be planted outside the transfer standards) be reviewed.

Action: CBST experts to present scientific-foundation of CBST to FGC and forest professionals at various forums and meetings.

5. CF Principles re Public and Private Seed Orchards

At the previous meeting, Brian suggested the Principles be reviewed through a CBST-lens and in response to questions raised by some orchardists. An issue statement was requested and subsequently provided in the agenda for this meeting. FGC clarification was sought to assist TACs, seed orchard managers and tree breeders in planning orchard changes in response to CBST.

The discussion led to the next agenda item, 2nd generation pine seed orchards. Further discussion on the Principles was subsequently deferred to FGCs in camera session as noted below.

6. 2nd Generation Pli Orchards

On March 14, 2017, FGC directed Kori, the tree breeders, and SelectSeed, VSOC and the Ministry to present a plan for identifying the materials and timelines for advancing towards establishment of the new second generation orchards.

This action item was deferred due to the pending introduction of CBST. On Nov 14, the ministry submitted a letter of interest to establish 2nd gen Pli orchards to Kori, as ITAC chair. VSOC also requested a response to its letter of interest submitted in 2014, and resubmitted to FGC and ITAC in Jan 2016 and Jan 2017. Brian indicated that SelectSeed had not submitted a letter of interest as he was awaiting recommendations from the tree breeder, Nick Ukrainetz, and FGC's response to the Board's Oct 8 letter.

Kori sought guidance from FGC on the process for allocating advance generation breeding materials. A map of Nick 's recently proposed Pli breeding breeding zones was shared. Confirmation of the new zones and estimating the projected seedling needs for these new 'zones' are required. Selections of pest tolerant parents are also pending. Stephen Joyce and Dan Gaudet were invited to represent their interests to Council. Updated Pli seed orchard production data for various sites was also shared.

The chair thanked Stephen and Dan for their presentations and convened an in camera session at approx. 11 am. Guests were asked to leave the meeting. Shane Berg, representing the Chief Forester, remained.

In camera minutes recorded by Annette van Niejenhuis; summary below approved by FGC Co-chairs.

Agenda item 5. CF's Principles re: Public and Private Seed Orchards

Council reviewed the principles that guide public and private seed orchard management in BC.

FGC recommends that the Chief Forester continue to encourage a healthy mix of public- and private-sector ownership and management of seed orchards (Principles #1 and #3) where capacity to deliver has been demonstrated. This includes considering private sector orchard interest prior to expanding existing Ministry capacity.

FGC supports ITAC and CTAC as the forums for discussing significant orchard changes in advance (Principle #5) and encourages all affected stakeholders to engage in the dialogue.

FGC will not recommend support of excess seed production capacity (Principle #6), but recognizes that multiple suppliers may be required to reduce risk, meet needs in some seed planning units, and may lead to improved best orchard management practices that reduce costs or improve delivery.

FGC recognizes that CBST changes seed planning unit boundaries. Council recommends that the Chief Forester continues to support existing orchards with access to new material most suitable for the lands served by these orchards (Principle #8).

Council did not recommend changes to the CF Principles; they should be followed in the re-alignment of seed planning units and orchards under CBST. Where additional capacity is required because of expanded area of use for a seed planning unit, Principle #3 applies. Where reduced capacity is required because of CBST, Principle #6 applies.

Agenda item 6. 2nd Generation Pli orchards

Council reviewed the expressions of interest from VSOC and the Ministry (FIRM) for 2nd generation Pli orchards. No expression of interest was received from SelectSeed.

Council recommends that the CF Principles be adhered to with the following actions:

Respond to VSOC letter of 17 March 2014 (with subsequent resubmissions in 2016 and 2017) confirming that FGC supports the CF Principles and recommending to the Chief Forester that VSOC be given access to 2nd generation material for the purpose of meeting its partners' seed needs for Pli in the north central seed planning units as per Principle #3. VSOC is deemed to have high probability of success in aiding the FGC in meeting our seed deployment objectives for CBST, gain, volume and pest resistance. VSOC is asked to continue to keep stakeholders aware of these orchard changes as they develop (Principle #5) through ITAC and FGC Business Planning processes (Species Plan updates).

Respond to Ministry letter of 14 November 2017 confirming that FGC supports the establishment of replacement, upgraded Pli orchards, per the ITAC Strategy for Northern Pli Class A, and as further described in the ministry letter. As noted in the FIRM expression of interest, the Guiding Principles Respecting Public and Private Orchard Management in BC apply, specifically #3 as it applies to expansion, #5 as it applies to significant changes, and #6 as it applies to avoiding redundancies.

CBST information to date indicates that A-Class seed deployability in the north central seed planning units will expand; however, timber harvest of Pli in upcoming decades may not result in significant increase in seed needs. FGC support for Pli orchard development at this time is not intended to remove any players with current capacity to serve this geographical area. Specific guidance with regard to expanding orchard capacity is provided in the CF Principles and should be followed by all parties through ITAC discussions. Orchard upgrading (replacement) is an eligible OTIP activity, but orchard capacity expansion is not; if public funds are part of an expansion plan, FGC requests further opportunity to provide comment.

Motion: FGC supports the VSOC request to develop a 2nd generation Pli orchard to serve its partners' seed needs; FGC supports the FIRM request to establish replacement Pli orchards with 2nd generation material consistent with ITAC's Strategy for Northern Pli Class A. (Annette/Pat) CARRIED.

Action: Co-chairs to reply to the VSOC and FIRM letters.

Agenda item #8 Proposals for SelectSeed funding of Ministry Positions.

Pat presented information provided by Michael Stoehr (A/Manager, Forest Genetics) regarding types of Ministry positions that might be supported by continuing the SelectSeed funding agreement. The present agreement expires on March 31, 2018, and has supported a breeder's position for three years for the purpose of succession and transition.

Pat noted that a number of FIRM Breeders are in an imminent retirement position. SelectSeed, in a letter dated 8 October 2017, provided a forecast of revenues and expenses. Council noted that SelectSeed recommends re-investing in orchards to meet its terms of reference, to assist FGC in meeting goals for CBST, gain, volume, and pest resistance, and to maintain the viability of the Company, and Council supports these aims. Council also recognizes that some of the funds can support FIRM in either transition or incremental positions that will enable us to meet FGC goals.

Motion: FGC direct SelectSeed to renew its MOU with FIRM for another 3-year term to fund one FTE (salary and benefits) in the tree breeding program to a maximum of \$100k annually. (Annette/Kori). CARRIED (9 in favour, 1 opposed, 2 abstained).

Agenda item #9 Response to SelectSeed Board Letter of Oct 8th

Action: Co-chairs to reply to the October 8th letter from SelectSeed.

In camera meeting concluded at approximately 2 pm.

10. FGC Business Plan 2017/18

Brian announced the FGC Business Plan for 2017/18 was completed and at the printers. Hardcopies will be distributed soon. The business plans include species plans, updated by Jack Woods, which are also posted on the FGC website at: <http://www.fgcouncil.bc.ca/doc-04-speciesplans.html>

Format and content of the business plan have been revised and includes the LBIS budget allocations to FGC subprograms.

Subprogram	2016/17	2016/17	2017/18	FGC	
	Requested	FGC Approved	Requested	Recommended 2017/18	Acutal LBIS Allocation
Genetic Conservation	\$ 250,768	\$ 188,700	\$ 266,658	\$ 266,658	\$ 164,094
Tree Breeding	\$ 1,493,000	\$ 1,180,000	\$ 1,415,500	\$ 1,415,500	\$ 1,341,238
Operational Tree Imp. Prog.	\$ 483,668	\$ 424,000	\$ 513,991	\$ 396,085	\$ 333,201
Cone and Seed Pest Mgt.	\$ 172,100	\$ 137,000	\$ 108,186	\$ 91,521	\$ 90,383
Seed Transfer & Genecology	\$ 551,850	\$ 428,800	\$ 578,500	\$ 578,500	\$ 455,085
Decision Support	\$ 85,000	\$ 76,500	\$ 140,000	\$ 140,000	\$ 116,000
Applied Tree Impr. and Biotech.	\$ 62,100	\$ 55,000	\$ 242,781	\$ -	\$ -
Administration	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Total	\$ 3,108,486	\$ 2,500,000	\$ 3,265,616	\$ 2,888,264	\$ 2,500,000

The 2017/18 allocations were determined by the ministry in consideration of TAC recommendations and other information including Forest Enhancement Society of BC's support of Dr. Tongli Wang work on the *in situ* forest genetic conservation catalogue and ClimateBC/ClimateWNA. Dr Wang's project costs were previously included the Genetics Conservation and Genecology subprograms, respectively.

11. Budget and Business Planning for 2018/19

FGC approved a new governance and business planning model for the 2018/19 fiscal year at its October 18 meeting (see Minutes and Streamlining Subcommittee's report). FGC direction is required to guide TACs' business planning processes and meetings, including provision of budget targets. Other follow-up action items noted in summary table.

The new governance model and historical LBIS \$ allocations to FGC's subprograms over the past several years were provided and discussed. Council agreed to set two total budget targets for each program as per table below. (Note: targets may be adjusted based on value of OTIP applications received on Dec 15).

Program	\$2.5 M	\$2.70	%
	Millions	Millions	
Genetic Conservation	\$0.20	\$0.22	8%
Resilience	\$0.50	\$0.54	20%
Tree Breeding	\$1.25	\$1.35	50%
Operational Tree Improvement	\$0.55	\$0.59	22%

FGC will request TACs prepare budgets for subprograms to align with these totals and FGC's goals. If program gaps exist or additional funds are needed to achieved FGCs goals, TACs are requested to identify and bring these forward.

Action: Co-chairs to provide budget targets and direction to TAC chairs in preparing budget proposals for 2018/19. Brian to assist Co-chairs with letters.

12. Seed Supply and FGC Recommendations to Diane Nicholls, Chief Forester

On September 12, 2017, FGC held a conference call to discuss seed supply and demand in response to this year's wildfires. A draft set of recommendations and principles were prepared, shared with the CF and discussed again at the Oct 18 meeting. Several edits were suggested.

Motion: The FGC Recommendations on Seed supply and Use in Wildfire-impacted Areas, updated on December 2, 2017, are hereby approved. (Joe/Gernot) CARRIED.

Action: Brian to forward FGC's seed use recommendations to Diane Nicholls.

13. New Business and Announcements

No new business or announcements were discussed

14. Future meetings

Tony Hopkin offered to host the next FGC meeting (budget) at Pacific Forestry Centre in March 2018. Scott King also offered to host next years FGC fall field trip in Golden in September. Council appreciated and supported both offers.

Action: Brian to issue Doodle Polls for face-to-face budget meeting in Victoria in early March, and fall field trip in Golden for September.

15. Adjourn

Motion: Meeting is hereby adjourned (Annette/Joe) CARRIED.